Idaho Transportation Board

129,000 Pound Truck Route Subcommittee

January 18, 2017

Idaho Transportation Board (ITB) 129,000 Pound Truck Route Subcommittee Chairman Jim Kempton called the meeting to order at 2:20 PM on Wednesday, January 18, 2017 at the Idaho Transportation Department in Boise, Idaho. ITB Members Jim Coleman, Jan Vassar and Dwight Horsch participated on the Subcommittee. ITB Chairman Jerry Whitehead and Vice Chairman Lee Gagner were also present.

Principal Subcommittee staff members and advisors in attendance included Deputy Attorney General (DAG) Larry Allen, Chief Engineer (CE) Kimbol Allen, Freight Program Manager Jeff Marker, Public Involvement Coordinator Adam Rush, Motor Vehicle Administrator (MVA) Alan Frew, Compliance Program Manager Reymundo Rodriguez, Bridge Asset Management Engineer Dan Gorley, and Executive Assistant to the Board Sue Higgins. District 2 Engineer Dave Kuisti and Operations Engineer Doral Hoff participated via video conference from the District 2 Office in Lewiston.

December 13, 2016 Meeting Minutes. Member Vassar made a motion to approve the minutes of the December 13, 2016 meeting. Member Horsch seconded the motion and it passed unopposed.

Case #201626: SH-13, Milepost (MP) 0.0 to 26.39. Chairman Kempton said staff received a second request to designate SH-13 for vehicle combinations up to 129,000 pounds. Two separate Subcommittee motions on the first request failed on a tie vote, one to recommend the full Board reject the route and the other to recommend the Board approve the route. The Board held the request in abeyance until the negotiated rule-making process was completed. In the interim, the applicant withdrew the route request.

Chairman Kempton said the Subcommittee needs to provide guidance to staff on how to process this second request. Staff could presumably re-submit the analysis that was presented to the Subcommittee in January 2016 or it could follow the process for new route requests and conduct another analysis and public comment period. Chairman Kempton noted that some of the Subcommittee's concerns earlier were the lack of shoulders or narrow shoulders, the geometry of the road, and other safety issues.

Member Vassar believes the majority of safety concerns were addressed during the rule-making process. She believes a new analysis, particularly on the safety factors, would be beneficial, and she also recommended conducting another hearing and public comment period.

DAG Allen recommended including information on the negotiated rule-making process in the notice for another hearing.

Member Horsch asked if staff knows how many commercial vehicles currently operate on SH-13 with weights between 80,000 and 105,500 pounds. MVA Frew said it would be difficult to get that information, as permits are issued for trucks, not for specific routes.

Member Vassar noted that the applicant, Doug Andrus Distributing LLC, also requested designating portions of SH-3 and SH-8 as 129,000 pound truck routes. She assumes staff will review those routes separately. Chairman Kempton concurred and added that one hearing may be held for all three routes.

In conclusion, Chairman Kempton said the consensus is to conduct a complete new analysis on SH-13. Consideration should be given to the rules and permitting requirements, and specifically to the comments on braking.

DAG Allen said that all of the comments that were received during the rule-making process may not have been incorporated into the rule. It may be beneficial for the Subcommittee to review those issues and staff's response. A summary could be provided in the Chief Engineer's analysis.

Some discussion followed on braking issues, stopping distance, and shifting loads. CE Allen said that when staff conducts its analysis on routes, it assumes that the commercial motor vehicles are operating legally and following all of the applicable rules and regulations.

Wally Burchak, KBC Transport, elaborated on a vehicle's momentum and braking abilities. He added that there are studies on this issue.

The meeting adjourned at 3:05 PM.

NOTE: After the Subcommittee meeting, Mr. Burchak submitted a letter with additional information. The unsolicited letter is attached, although it is not associated with the hearing process on SH-13. It is included because it contains pertinent information on safety and on the subject route.

Sue S. Higgins

Respectfully submitted by:
SUE S. HIGGINS
Executive Assistant & Secretary
Idaho Transportation Board

SSH:129submin2017^01.docx;1/25/17

January 20, 2017

Dear Mr. Kempton and Mr. Whitehead,

I had plenty of time to think about hearing during slow drive home in snow storm. First I want to thank both of you for listening to our concerns and developing a plan to thoroughly explore the issues. I get frustrated with the issue and had reached a point I just wanted it over. Your decision to reopen the review process is probably a wise decision. Questions were asked during the hearing that I feel given our location and ties to timber industry I could help answer or point ITD in right direction.

The breakdown between 80K trucks and 105K trucks I would estimate 70% 80K trucks and 30% 105K trucks. The vast majority of 80K trucks are log trucks. The log trucks use Hwy 13 especially for logs coming out of Selway/Lochsa River drainage and also they use less fuel on Hwy 13 than Hwy 162 because it is a steady gradual grade starting at Kooskia. Majority of truck accidents in last 10 years that I know of have been 105K trucks. Brad Baker lives off Hwy 13 and spent last week hauling logs on Hwy 13 would be a good source to give percentage breakdown. If you do traffic counts or observe truck types you will have to be careful time of year you do this. We have had 3 days of 40 deg plus weather and logging roads will start to break up. Spring breakup usually runs from middle of February into early May. During this period log truck traffic will be significantly decreased and will not give you accurate data on truck usage.

In 2016 log truck traffic was especially heavy due to fire timber salvage operations. Log truck traffic will be significantly decreased in 2017 unless USFS (Forest Service) Stewardship sale goes through in Selway/Lochsa River Drainage. This is collaborative effort between environmentalist , industry and USFS involving 100 million board feet of timber. Average volume is 230 to 240 log truck loads per million board feet of timber with a significant portion volume being trucked up Hwy 13 to Grangeville or Tamarack. Hard to believe these groups can agree on anything but word is sale could go through.

I can report ADA County gave verbal approval to KBC application to haul 129K into Meridian via 10 mile road and Franklin Road. I should have written confirmation in 15 to 20 days. ADA County is still uncomfortable with 129K. They said a major reason KBC was approved was our outspoken concern for 129K truck safety. This will open up the door for others to haul 129K in Ada County. Early on in 129K debate I asked what is stopping distance of fully loaded trucks. No one could answer this question including myself. Education on braking, stopping distances and driver reactions will give all of us more knowledge on the issue to make better decisions.

In the hearing it was mentioned about 129K corridors. I fully agree with this concept. My comments on the need for enhanced braking on steer axles will cause problems with not having rules more stringent than Federal rules (as we learned negotiated rules). This information on braking and driver reactions can be used to determine which highways provide the safest routes, or what road areas need to be modified over time to improve truck safety. The NHTSA brake study shows disc brakes on steer axle improved stopping distance in all scenarios, but disc brakes on drive axles had less effect when scenarios did not cause driver's reactions to make a panic stop. An article in Heavy Duty Trucking explained that in panic stopping situations (drivers mashing on brakes) disc brakes have the greatest affect. This helps explain some of NHTSA conclusions when disc brakes on drive axles seemed to have little effect. The only thing that makes sense to me on disc steer axle brakes always performing better is steer axle brakes are having to stop a larger force of momentum. This is same reason steer axle brakes

on cars always wear out faster than rear brakes. Steer axles typically carry weights of 12K to 13.5K, while drive axles carry weights of 17K. If tire contact and friction has biggest affect on braking, then drive axles would have largest affect on truck braking. This is not what NHTSA brake study is showing.

I realize 129K is here to stay. I also realize I need to work with ITD to improve our highways which will improve safety for our drivers and the public. At times I get to pushy and outspoken. I will make a better effort to work with ITD rather than against it. I view our interests as being the same just at times with different viewpoints. My youngest son is a mechanical engineer with Daimler Trucks (builds Freightliner and Western Star Trucks) I will try and obtain any information they have on subject provided it is not proprietary. I will not bother board members in the future with direct contact. I will communicate information directly with ITD engineers. I just thought this information would be useful.

Thank you

Wally